

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
OF THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS  
MARSHALL DIVISION**

**RING PLUS, INC**

**Plaintiff**

**V.**

**CINGULAR WIRELESS, LLC. ET AL.**

**Defendants**

§  
§  
§  
§  
§  
§  
§

**No. 2:06CV159**

**ORDER**

The Court enters the following *sua sponte*. On August 29, 2007, the Court ordered Plaintiff Ring Plus, Inc. to provide the Court and Defendants with a supplement to its privilege log with respect to certain documents being withheld as privileged. Ring Plus produced the supplemental privilege log to Defendants on September 4, 2007. On September 10, 2007, Defendants filed its Brief in Support of Compelling Discovery of Certain Withheld Documents (Docket Entry # 148). Defendants focused on (1) documents related to the identity of prior art to the patent in suit and to the patent applicants' and/or their patent attorney's knowledge of this prior art and intent to deceive the United States Patent Office (Document No. 21 for RFP 1 and Document No. 1 for RFP 4) and (2) transmittal letters (Document Nos. 54, 56, and 63 for RFP 1). Plaintiff filed a response in opposition to Defendants' motion, requesting an *in camera* inspection of the documents by this Court.

The Court ordered an *in camera* inspection of the disputed documents. Thereafter, Plaintiff submitted to the Court for *in camera* review the documents contained in its amended privilege log. The Court has reviewed the documents at issue and finds Plaintiff properly withheld the documents under either the work product or attorney/client privilege as claimed by Plaintiff.

**IT IS SO ORDERED.**

**SIGNED this 11th day of October, 2007.**

  
CAROLINE M. CRAVEN  
UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE